

## Jurnal ilmiah internasional

Judul Artikel: Transformation of canals in colonial batavia, Penulis: **EUIS PUSPITA DEWI**, KEMAS RIDWAN KURNIAWAN, EVAWANI ELLISA, Nama Jurnal: International Journal of Architecture and Urban Studies 3 (1), 53-63, 2018, Volume Jurnal: 3, Nomor Jurnal: 1, Tahun Terbit Jurnal: 2018, Halaman: 53-63, ISSN: 2147-9836, Penerbit: www.dakam.org/ijaus

### Reviewer Evaluation Report

Thank you for reviewing the attached article. Your review should be based on your expert analysis, good information on the subject of the article and the relevant literature. Please point out any deficiencies in the text and, if necessary, provide instruction on the amendments or modifications to the text.

#### General data on paper

Paper Number: 117010 Paper Title: Transformation of Canals in Colonial Batavia
---

#### Evaluation Criteria

##### [1] Articles's content rating

Rounding numbers 1 to 5 evaluate each of these evaluation criteria of the articles content where **5** means complete suitability for publication while **1** absolute grounds for refusal of the article.

Article content assessment criteria	evaluation				
1 The paper is written according to the ' <b>Guidelines for Authors</b> '.	1	X	3	4	5
2 Paper title reflects the content and purpose of the research.	1	2	3	4	X
3 Abstract includes information important for understanding the content of the paper.	1	2	X	4	5
4 The introduction clearly defines the purpose and objective of the work/research.	1	2	X	4	5
5 The methodology is clearly defined.	1	2	3	X	5
6 Showing results support the applied methodology and conclusions.	1	2	3	X	5
7 Article is a contribution by the theory / practice.	1	2	3	X	5

##### [2] Articles's organization rating

Rounding numbers 1 to 5 evaluate each of these evaluation criteria of the articles content where **5** means complete suitability for publication while **1** absolute grounds for refusal of the article.

Article organization assessment criteria	evaluation				
1 The article is well organized and conforms to the " <b>Guidelines for authors</b> ".	1	X	3	4	5
2 The extent of the article is appropriate	1	2	3	X	5
3 Figures, tables and pictures are corresponding.	1	2	3	X	5
4 The references reflect the topicality of the article.	1	2	3	X	5
5 References are cited as directed by (Harvard system).	1	2	3	4	X
6 The article is written in a standard language, relevant and interesting.	1	2	X	4	5

##### [3] Reviewer's recommendation

Mark with "X" one of the options. You recommend the article is to be

1	Published as it is	
2	Conditionally accepted with minor revisions (editor will check)	X
3	Conditionally accepted with the necessary changes as recommended by reviewer	
4	Thoroughly changed	
5	Rejected	

**[4] Remarks and recommendations of reviewer**

Format:

The text requires proofreading, i.e. "physicality" (p.1) could be replaced by "form" or "physical form", "photos from many sources" (p.1) should be "from different sources", "in the last 19th century" (p.4) should be "in the late 19th century", "transportation tools" (p.7) could be "means of transportation" ...

Some of the legend items of Figure 1 could not be followed within the text, i.e. *F – Plaisant huis*. If not required to mention in the text, then they might also be removed from the Figure so that the map could be more visible.

"The downtown area was used only for trading and as a commercial centre until 1960 and as a residential area until the end of the 18th century (Merrillees, 2000)" – Referring to this sentence in p.4, dates are confusing. Commercial centre until 1960, but residential till the end of 18th century? – This is a real time gap to be mentioned in one sentence which requires re-evaluation.

Content:

In the Introduction part of the study, the use of canals for the period could be more specifically explained, so that readers would have an idea how the canals were shaping the urban macroform during that period and how they were used by citizens.

The author should state reasons for the decline of the city in the second period more clearly. The statements could be supported by references.

For the third period of canals, it is recommended to give the title "re-development" because this is not a development process from the very beginning but recreation of an already existing canal system in a different way.

The use of the canals in the third period and the reason of reconstruction of canals could not be understood clearly. The author could explain the reasons more clearly why they needed to build new canals.

The conclusion part of the article could be more satisfactory by providing the contributions of the methodology and findings of the research in urban history or urban morphology studies.

References:

References should be sorted A-Z.  
There are references not cited within the text, i.e. Van derZee, D., 1926  
There are references cited wrong within the text, i.e. Upton 2009 is cited as 2008 in the text (p.6).

The screenshot shows a Gmail inbox with a search bar containing "dakam". The selected email is from "DAKAM Journal" (journal@dakam.org) dated Thursday, Dec 28, 2017, 3:01 PM. The subject is "DAKAM IJAUS - About Your Manuscript - Minor Revision". The email content includes a reference to "No IJAUS 117010 - TRANSFORMATION OF CANALS IN COLONIAL BATAVIA" and a message from the editorial board regarding a minor revision. It mentions that the manuscript is acceptable subject to satisfactory minor revision and that reviewer comments should be taken into account. It also provides a link to the journal's guidelines and expresses hope for receiving the revised manuscript. The email is signed by the Editorial Board of DAKAM International Journal of Architecture and Urban Studies. There is one attachment, "Scanned by Gmail".

The screenshot shows a Gmail inbox with a search bar containing "dakam". The selected email is from "euis pd" (euis.pd75@gmail.com) dated January 24, 2018, 9:55 AM. The subject is "Review Form 1170...". The email content includes a message to the DAKAM Journal Committee, stating that the sender has submitted a revised paper and hopes for immediate publication. There is one attachment, "Scanned by Gmail". Below this email, another email from "euis pd" (euis.pd75@gmail.com) dated January 24, 2018, 10:07 AM is visible, addressed to the DAKAM Editorial Board. The email content is partially obscured but appears to be a follow-up message.

Browser address bar: <https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/dakam/FMfcgxmXKvzqCWGvTvsFTzPfpFIVfIZ>

Gmail interface showing search results for "dakam".

Compose button and navigation menu (Inbox: 3,362, Starred, Snoozed, Sent, Drafts: 39, More, Labels).

Search results for "dakam":

- 25 of 48 results.
- Message 1: "I sent my revised paper for DAKAM Journal Publication. I hope my paper can be published in DAKAM International Journal of Architecture and Urban Studies immediately. Thank you." Author: Euis Puspita Dewi. Ref.: No IJAUS 117010 - TRANSFORMATION OF CANALS IN COLONIAL BATAVIA.
- Message 2: From DAKAM Journal <journal@dakam.org> to me. Date: Jan 26, 2018, 3:32 PM. Content: "We have not received your revised paper and Revision Notes. Could you please sent them to this address. Please pay attention to the Guidelines at <http://www.dakam.org/guidelines-ss>." Sender: Efe Duyan, DAKAM IJAUS Publication Coordinator.
- Message 3: From euis pd <euis.pd75@gmail.com> to DAKAM. Date: Feb 5, 2018, 9:35 AM. Content: "Dear, Editorial Board..."

Windows taskbar at the bottom shows the time 12:32 on 12/03/2024.

Browser address bar: <https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/dakam/FMfcgxmXKvzqCWGvTvsFTzPfpFIVfIZ>

Gmail interface showing search results for "dakam".

Compose button and navigation menu (Inbox: 3,362, Starred, Snoozed, Sent, Drafts: 39, More, Labels).

Search results for "dakam":

- 25 of 48 results.
- Message 1: From to DAKAM. Content: "Dear, Editorial Board DAKAM International Journal of Architecture and Urban Studies. Here is my revised paper for DAKAM Journal Publication. I have submitted Manuscripts in different parts, 1) Identification Page, 2) Title Page and Main Text, 3) Visual Materials as separate files. I read in PAPER GUIDELINES FOR IJAUS AND IJSSIS, the papers that are not submitted online system will not be considered. **Where I have to submit by online system?** I hope my paper can be published in DAKAM International Journal of Architecture and Urban Studies immediately. Thank you." Author: Euis Puspita Dewi.
- Message 2: 13 Attachments - Scanned by Gmail. Includes a folder named "McAfee LiveSafe" and a file named "Figure 4.tif".

Windows taskbar at the bottom shows the time 12:32 on 12/03/2024.

https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/dakam/FMfcgxmXkvzqCWGvTvsFTzPfpFIVfVIZ

Gmail Search: dakam

13 Attachments • Scanned by Gmail

Figure 4.tif

Figure 5.tif

Figure 6.tif

Figure 9.tif

TRANSFORMATION OF CANALS IN COLONIAL BATAVIA

TITTLE PAGE AN...

12:32 12/03/2024

https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/dakam/FMfcgxmXkvzqCWGvTvsFTzPfpFIVfVIZ

Gmail Search: dakam

25 of 48

TITTLE PAGE AN...

**DAKAM Journal** <journal@dakam.org> to me Feb 5, 2018, 4:48 PM

Thank you we received your file. It will be included in the first available issue. You'll be contacted for a final proof reading.

Kind Regards  
Efe Duyan

**euis pd** <euis.pd75@gmail.com> to DAKAM Feb 5, 2018, 5:21 PM

Okay, I will be waiting for final proof reading  
Thank you

**euis pd** <euis.pd75@gmail.com> to DAKAM Feb 15, 2018, 12:03 PM

Dear **DAKAM Journal** (IAUS),

12:33 12/03/2024

Browser address bar: <https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/dakam/FMfcgxmXKvzqCWGvTvsFTzPFpFIVVfIZ>

Gmail interface showing search results for "dakam".

**Compose**

**Inbox** 3,362

- Starred
- Snoozed
- Sent
- Drafts** 39
- More

**Labels** +

---

Search: **dakam** 25 of 48

**euis pd** <euis.pd75@gmail.com> to DAKAM Feb 15, 2018, 12:03 PM

Dear **DAKAM** Journal (IJAUS),

I sent the revision of my article. I have put the yellow highlight that which indicates the need for a change in that section. I hope this article can be published immediately.

Thank you,

Euis Puspita Dewi

Ref.: No IJAUS 117010 - TRANSFORMATION OF CANALS IN COLONIAL BATAVIA

---

**euis pd** <euis.pd75@gmail.com> to DAKAM Feb 17, 2018, 12:12 PM

this is the revision of article..

One attachment • Scanned by Gmail

Windows taskbar at the bottom shows the time 12:34 and date 12/03/2024.